Minutes Warrensburg Zoning Board of Appeals May 8, 2014

Board Members Present: Donne Lynn Winslow, Alan Hall, Sr., James Cooper, Mark Morey, Harold Moffitt

Others Present: Pastor Nancy Barrows, Patti Corlew, Chris Belden

Meeting Commenced at 7:00 p.m.

Mr. Cooper - The first item of business on the agenda is the roll call. Let the record reflect that all the board members are present and seated, except Mr. Moffitt, which constitutes a quorum of the Board. The next item of business on the agenda is the approval of the minutes of October 10, 2013. Since I abstained...

(Mr. Moffitt entered room).

Mr. Cooper - Are you back, Mr. Moffitt?

Mr. Moffitt - Yes. I was the only one that showed. They cancelled the meeting. Sherryl and I.

Mrs. Winslow - Oh dear.

Mr. Cooper - Alright, we'll let the record reflect that Mr. Moffitt returned. We now have five board members here. Now with regard to the minutes, as you recall, I had to recuse myself from the second part of the proceedings in the, at the last meeting of the board. my vote in connection with the minutes will relate only to that first portion, which was the application for the Ulrich Sign Company for the sign on Tops Market there. Does everybody understand that? Okay, are there additions are corrections? I have a couple. first page, page 129, about halfway down where it says, Mr. Cooper, the lines beginning "approved by consensus of the board". It should read, "we're going to invert the order of business". I might have said revert, but invert is correct, so I'm sticking to that. next page, 130, about a tenth of the way down, it says, "Tops Grocery store", that line, after the word "feel" in that line, the word "in" should be changed to is. On page 134, fourth line down, the word over, the words over borne, should be one word overborne, O V E R B O And page 136, the very last block paragraph, begins Mr. Cooper - "Now at this time," the line below that, "variance that it be made". Instead of the word "a", it should be on. I guess either one would work, but I think on is more correct. Those are the only changes I have. Does anybody else have any changes with connection with the Flanagan application?

Mr. Hall - I have (inaudible).

Mr. Cooper - What page is that, Alan?

Mr. Hall - It's on page 144. Remark I made and it says "inaudible". (Inaudible). I've got a question; where are you going to find an old

Packard touring car? I made the remark that you're going to try and bring it back to the way it was, it used to be... I asked him, "where are you going to find an old Packard touring car"? And everybody in the audience knew what I was talking about, but there used to be one...

Mr. Cooper - Patti doesn't even know what a Packard is.

Mrs. Corlew - No, I don't.

Mr. Cooper - Any other changes?

Mr. Morey - I don't have any.

Mr. Cooper - Alright. I'm looking around. Where did Mr. Moffitt go?

Mrs. Winslow - Getting a drink of water.

Mr. Cooper - Oh. Alright, let the record reflect that the minutes are approved by consensus of the Board as amended. And the first item of business on the agenda under new business is area variance ZBA 2014-1, matter of the Warrensburg Free Methodist Church. to say preliminarily that as a matter of a pro bono; that means I didn't charge for my services, I represented the church when it bought this property. If anybody thinks I have a conflict interest because of that, speak up, but frankly, I don't see it If I was paid, the suggestion would be that my judgment would be compromised, but since I did it for free, I think I'm a free Pastor, do you have any So anybody have any objections? objections?

Pastor Barrows - I do not, sir.

Mr. Cooper - Anybody else? Okay. Then I'll proceed to preside over this application. Mr. Belden, would you explain how this matter comes before us please?

Mr. Belden - Yes. The Warrensburg Free Methodist Church owns property both at 250 River Street and 258 River Street, 250 being the smaller parcel shown on the map, which is where the actual church is located and 258 is where the, there's a small vacant home with about I think over ten acres of land accompanying that. They are looking to sell off the larger parcel; however doing so, they would like to keep approximately six, 60 feet of the road frontage and back a little ways I guess for future parking lot expansion and so on. However, the current lot width of that parcel is 122 feet in a district that requires 125 foot lot width, which would be fine if they were just selling off the parcel without making these boundary line adjustments, but because they want to leave 62 feet of lot width on the larger parcel and it would, it would require her to obtain a variance to do so.

Mr. Cooper - Pastor, would you raise your right hand please? Pastor Barrows - Yes.

Mr. Cooper - Do you swear to tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth?

Pastor Barrows - I do.

Mr. Cooper - Do you think the mike is going to pick her up where she's sitting, Patti. Do you want her to move over here next to the table?

Mrs. Corlew - I can just move it. And then it should...

Mr. Cooper - I see... The one thing that confuses me about this application. I understand... It took me awhile substantively to figure out what you're doing, but why are you reserving 80 feet on the rear? Is that just for future expansion of the church?

Pastor Barrows - There is a wetland there. You're really, not really going to be able to do anything there, so when I approached the Society about the possibility of sale of the property, they were concerned about neighbors, and so they asked about a buffer, which would be sort of a buffer, the green space. So in looking at the property that we purchased at the time, there's a rather natural outcropping down behind... Let's see, it's down behind... I can't think of the name of the gentleman. Gillingham's. That sort of comes out there 80 feet, so it just became a... It literally comes right across the back of the wetland and to a portion of the property where we have already filled in a little bit and raised up so we have, being able to create a little of additional parking. So it seemed rather a natural buffer to put in there just to retain that property for the church and ya know, give us a good space for the new neighbor, and then the piece coming across the lawn, the original purpose of purchase of that property was for the future expansion of the church. In taking this sanctuary they would go... I'm terrible at directions. West?

Mr. Cooper - That sounds right.

Pastor Barrows - (Inaudible) the house.

Mr. Cooper - Assume River Street runs east and west, then towards the house would be west.

Pastor Barrows - Would be west. So if you were going to be able to have enough property to, in the future, expand the sanctuary of the church, you would need to go that way in a natural direction with the rooflines. So the society was concerned about retaining enough property so that should we come to a point where we could do that, we would be able to do that in the future.

Mr. Cooper - Have you got a prospective purchaser for this larger tract?

Pastor Barrows - I do have. Bill Oehler is interested and has, we have talked back and forth and reached... We're not under contract yet, but we've reached an agreement in the offer/counter offer process where he is interested. He's also interested in rehabilitating the house.

Mr. Cooper - That's what I wanted to ask you about. As I understood, when, after you, the church acquired that property, they really discovered how distressed it was. There was frozen stalactite or water fall inside the house the first winter as I recall.

Pastor Barrows - Yes.

Mr. Cooper - And I'm, I've driven by there dozens and dozens of times, but I can't recall if the house is still standing and there was talk about using, the fire company using it for a burn and having it razed. It's still there?

Pastor Barrows - It is still there because we discovered asbestos and so had to go through the appropriate process to have that removed, before they'd ever consider a burn. It's also quite close to the neighbor on the west side, and the church has not had the funds really to pay a contractor to come and tear it down. So it had basically stood empty and unused for the entire time the church has owned it.

Mr. Cooper - Well, I, I don't know. Perhaps I'm stating stuff that has already been discussed and resolved, but it looks to me that this is not a boundary line adjustment. This is a, this is a two lot subdivision of the larger piece. Chris, have you looked at it from that prospective?

Mr. Belden - I guess I don't understand. The, the existing boundary line will be, will, will, will be kind of blown up to the, where, where it's exist... Where, where the darker...

Mr. Cooper - How many... How many acres do you think this is? 80 x about 300. Let me just see what this adds up to. 195, 155 and 45. You got a calculator?

Mr. Belden - Okay.

Mr. Cooper - It's 395 feet by 80. What's that?

Mr. Belden - 31,600.

Mr. Cooper - 31,600?

Mr. Belden - Yep, that's right.

Mr. Cooper - Multiply that number by .000043 or 23.

Mr. Belden - How many zeros? Five?

Mr. Cooper - Four zeros, I think.

Mr. Belden - And then 53?

Mr. Cooper - 23. No, no .00023. Three zeros, followed by 23.

Mr. Belden - What's the first equation you had then?

Mr. Cooper - $31,600 \times .00023$.

Mr. Belden - 7.268?

Mr. Cooper - That's seven acres. If the math is right. Alright then add another zero.

Mr. Belden - .7... .727?

Mr. Cooper - That's got to be bigger than ¾ of a acre, don't you think?

Mr. Morey - 43,560 (inaudible).

Mr. Cooper - Okay, 17327? Yeah, that's, that's right. Yep. But that's, that's the back rectangle. The front one, we'd have to make a triangle and figure out that area and then 60 by 140. So it's about an acre, I would say. Wouldn't you guess? Yeah.

Mr. Belden - I guess, I guess I don't follow the... The yellow shaded portion, I guess. I don't know if it's yellow on your maps, but that shaded area, the newly shaded area is, is not going to be a new parcel separate from the church. It would be inclusive of the church parcel at 250 River.

Mr. Cooper - They're going to be made, they're going to be merged?

Mr. Belden - It's going to be a boundary line adjustment. So...

Mr. Cooper - So the boundary line adjustment will be with the church parcel, so it'll now have 60 feet on River Street and it'll be more or less 220 feet deep. Okay? Alright. What, wasn't there APA ramifications with this when we were talking about tearing down the, the other house because it's, it's so close to the river, and there's also wetlands on the lot. I, I remember contacting the APA and they were saying you could bulldoze the structure into the pit of the foundation and cover it, but if, if they had jurisdiction over that, they may have jurisdiction over this boundary line adjustment.

Mr. Belden - Right.

Mr. Cooper - And they're criteria is if it's more than a quarter of an acre as a general proposition, you need a permit. So, ya know, whatever we do here tonight, Pastor, you might still be in the bureaucratic soup, so to speak, having to get approvals from other entities.

Pastor Barrows - Okay.

Mr. Cooper - Do you follow me?

Pastor Barrows - The APA has been out and has marked the property. So I have problem contacting the APA.

Mr. Cooper - Well, you might, you might be wise to get a letter of non-jurisdiction from them because otherwise you could get yourself in trouble and the church doesn't need that. You also, you had trouble with these neighbors on River Street. They pretty much ignored your property rights back there, were running ATV's and all kinds of recreational vehicles back there.

Pastor Barrows - I have not had that issue the last few years.

Mr. Cooper - No?

Pastor Barrows - I haven't seen anybody.

Mr. Cooper - Pastor Richards had trouble with that.

Mr. Belden - I think the tenant's gone, that was in, that was causing the issue.

Mr. Cooper - Okay. Alright. Does everybody understand what the church proposes to do here?

Mrs. Winslow - Yes.

Mr. Cooper - Okay. Let's just go through the application like we're supposed to. The first question; the answer, whether an undesirable change will be produced in the character of the neighborhood or a detriment to nearby properties would be created by granting the area variance. The answer is no. "The church already exists. The green space will not be altered. The property will continue to be

maintained. In fact, it will be improved". So you're saying there, Pastor, that if a crow flies over it and looks down, the only thing that's changed is the boundary lines. There's no physical change in the premises. Is that, is that right?

Pastor Barrows - That's correct.

Mr. Cooper - Okay. Number two, whether the benefit sought by the applicant can be achieved by some method feasible for the applicant to pursue other than an area variance. And you answer that no. "In order to access the acreage behind the church, the new owner will need the property that we are describing. The church purchased the property with future expansion in mind. We will need a variance to sell". To supplement that, you're saying you need capital to fix the foundation of your church?

Pastor Barrows - Yes.

Mr. Cooper - And if you just sold the whole thing outright, that would have defeated the original purpose for acquiring the property, which was to expand the parking lot. Right?

Pastor Barrows - Correct.

Mr. Cooper - So you really don't have any option and if you want to have a viable parking area for your church other than to either not sell the property or to proceed with this variance application. Is that right?

Pastor Barrows - That's correct.

Mr. Cooper - Okay. Number three, whether the requested area variance is substantial. You say, "yes". Wrong answer.

Pastor Barrows - Okay.

Mr. Cooper - You're supposed to put no.

Pastor Barrows - Well, I'm looking at this half of it. I mean, in all honesty, it is.

Mr. Cooper - It's, it's, it's perfectly... I don't know. Mr. Morey's better than me with these percentages? Is that more than 50%, Mr. Morey?

Mr. Morey - It's not much more.

Mr. Cooper - Okay. About 50%, which is our tipping point for starting to get our attention.

Pastor Barrows - Okay.

Mr. Cooper - And the only thing that it seems to me I don't know if Mr. Oehler is going to be able to get vehicles by this side of the house here. Maybe he will, but I guess that's his problem. If he, if he can't figure that out... Did you show him on the land about...?

Pastor Barrows - Yes.

Mr. Cooper - And he said that was alright?

Pastor Barrows - Hm hm.

Mr. Cooper - Okay. Four - whether the proposed variance will have an adverse effect or impact on the physical or environmental conditions in the neighborhood or district. And your is no for the same answer you gave in the first one. It was just a change in the boundary

lines. "The property will be returned to the tax roll". You're referring to the larger parcel which now is exempt from taxes, 'cause it's owned by the church?

Pastor Barrows - Yes.

Mr. Cooper - Existing uninhabitable home will be rehabilitated. Any benefit to the existing properties along River Street corridor is a benefit to the town. The impact will be substantial in the scope of its improvement"! Trying to turn that around, hah?

Pastor Barrows - (Inaudible). Anything we do (inaudible), the better. (Inaudible).

Mr. Cooper - Well, it won't be long before that building is going to start falling down on itself and it will be an eyesore. Right? Maybe, maybe the town will come after you and say it's too dangerous and you're going to have to spend the money to raze it. Whether the alleged difficulty was self-created, which consideration shall be relevant to the decision of the Zoning Board of Appeals but shall not necessarily preclude granting of the area variance. You put, no. "The original deed conveyed to the church was 122 feet. Our need for the sale is because of foundation issues in our building 250 River Street". Well, when you bought that house, you couldn't foresee the extent of its damage until the following winter, I take it, 'til the elements reveal themselves. Is that so?

Pastor Barrows - I believe that is so, yes. That would've been when Richard Leonard was the senior pastor there. So it was before me.

Mr. Cooper - Yeah. I keep calling him Pastor Richard, but it's, that was his first name.

Pastor Barrows - Yes.

Mr. Cooper - Alright. And we'll incorporate the, your answers to those remarks and your letter of, what is this, April $19^{\rm th}$?

Pastor Barrows - Yes.

Mr. Cooper - Okay. Incorporate that in the record. Anybody have any questions of the Pastor? Mr. Hall?

Mr. Hall - No.

Mr. Cooper - Good thing I got Mr. Morey here to keep me honest. Alright. Let's go through the environmental, State Environmental Review Act. I'll move that this matter be determined to be a Type II listed action under the State Environmental Quality Review Act. Is there a second to the motion?

Mr. Morey - I'll second.

Mr. Cooper - Any discussion? Alright. All those in favor, I indicate by saying aye.

Mrs. Winslow - Aye.

Mr. Morey - Aye.

Mr. Moffitt - Aye.

Mr. Hall - Aye.

Mr. Cooper - I'll let the record reflect the board is unanimous in finding that this is a Type II listed action under the State Environmental Quality Review Act.

RESOLUTION #2014-1

Motion by: James Cooper Second by: Mark Morey

RESOLVED, to deem application ZBA #2014-1 by the Warrensburg Free Methodist Church, tax map #210.20-5-57, located at 258 River Street, for an area variance, as a Type II listed action under the State Environmental Quality Review Act.

DULY ADOPTED ON THIS 8TH DAY OF MAY, 2014 BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE:

Ayes: Donne Lynn Winslow, Alan Hall, James Cooper, Mark Morey,

Harold Moffitt Nays: None

Mr. Cooper - And does anybody..? Well, let's move the thing in the affirmative, which is the custom of the Board. I'll move the matter in the affirmative. Is there a second?

Mrs. Winslow - I'll second.

Mr. Cooper - Mrs. Winslow seconds the motion. Discussion. anybody see anything that we should condition this with, change the, change the 62 feet to something else? Instead of giving them 60, give 'em 55 or anything like that? You see any reason for that? Anybody? Any other conditions you think should be imposed? Alright, any discussion on the merits of the application? Whether you feel that the area variance sought complies with the exception set forth in the Town Law and our zoning ordinance justifying granting an area Any comments or suggestions? Okay. I'll call the question then. Any vote age would be a vote in the affirmative to grant the area variance application of the Warrensburg Free Methodist Church. All those in favor, indicate by saying aye.

Mr. Moffitt - Aye.

Mr. Morey - Aye.

Mrs. Winslow - Aye.

Mr. Hall - Aye.

Mr. Cooper - Okay. I hear four affirmative ayes, with mine would be unanimous, so let the record reflect that all four, all five board members voted in the affirmative.

RESOLUTION #2014-2

Motion by: James Cooper Second by: Donne Winslow **RESOLVED**, to approve application ZBA #2014-1 by the Warrensburg Free Methodist Church, tax map #210.20-5-57, located at 258 River Street, for an area variance to allow conveyance of property to 250 River Street, making the lot width of this lot less then the required 125 feet.

DULY ADOPTED ON THIS 8TH DAY OF MAY, 2014 BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE:

Ayes: Donne Lynn Winslow, Alan Hall, James Cooper, Mark Morey,

Harold Moffitt Nays: None

Mr. Cooper - And that means, Pastor, that you, as far as we're concerned, you're entitled to your area variance, but you may have to get your subdivision approval or site plan review. I don't know. You have to certainly run this by the APA. And Mr. Belden will counsel you with regard to whether you have to go through site plan review or subdivision review with regard to the town. You might be required to do a deed to merge the two parcels, the one you want to cut out that's in back of the church and the 60 feet alongside in order to avoid that because if you, if you deed the property to Mr. Oehler first, then we have three parcels there, then there has been a subdivision. So you have to get competent advice from Mr. Belden about that and not step on your own toes. Okay?

Pastor Barrows - Okay.

Mr. Cooper - Alright, any other matters to be brought... Oh yeah, we got the organizational meeting.

Mrs. Corlew - Just the Vice Chair and Secretary.

Mr. Cooper - Was I appointed by the Board?

Mrs. Corlew - You were.

Mr. Cooper - Alright, any nominations for Vice Chairperson?

Mrs. Winslow - I nominate Mark.

Mr. Cooper - I'll second that nomination. Any other nominations? Okay. There being no other nominations, let's just have an aye vote for Mark Morey, just so that the Board has acted affirmatively. All those in favor of appointing Mark Morey as the Assistant Vice Chairperson, indicate by saying aye.

Mr. Hall - Aye.

Mrs. Winslow - Aye.

Mr. Moffit - Aye.

Mr. Cooper - Let the record reflect that except for the Mr. Morey, all of the board members voted in favor.

RESOLUTION #2014-3

Motion by: Donne Winslow Seconded by: James Cooper

RESOLVED, to appoint Mark Morey as Vice Chairperson for the Warrensburg Zoning Board of Appeals for the year 2014.

DULY ADOPTED ON THIS 8TH DAY OF MAY, 2014 BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE:

Ayes: Donne Lynn Winslow, Alan Hall, James Cooper, Harold Moffitt

Nays: None

Abstention: Mark Morey

Mr. Cooper - Now I'll have a motion to appoint a board member secretary. Is there a motion?

Mrs. Winslow - I nominate Harold.

Mr. Cooper - Is there a second to that?

Mr. Morey - I'll second that.

Mr. Cooper - Mr. Morey seconds.

(Laughter)

Mr. Cooper - The burdens of this office are tremendous, Mr. Moffitt. You should consider...

(Tape inaudible; people talking at once).

Mr. Cooper - Alright, any other nominations? Okay, all those in favor, indicate by saying aye.

Mr. Morey - Aye.

Mrs. Winslow - Aye.

Mr. Hall - Aye.

Mr. Cooper - Okay. Let the record reflect that the board has voted unanimously with the exception of the abstention of Mr. Moffitt to have him appointed secretary of the board.

RESOLUTION #2014-4

Motion by: Donne Winslow Seconded by: Mark Morey

RESOLVED, to appoint Harold Moffitt as Secretary for the Warrensburg Zoning Board of Appeals for the year 2014.

DULY ADOPTED ON THIS 8^{TH} DAY OF MAY, 2014 BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE:

Ayes: Donne Lynn Winslow, Alan Hall, James Cooper

Nays: None

Abstention: Harold Moffitt

Mr. Cooper - What is the pleasure of the board with regard to the meeting night and time? Still Thursday, 7:00? Does that work for you folks? And that second, second Thursday of the month? Basically that's the only option we're given anyway, isn't it?

Mr. Belden - Well, we could change it. We'd have to check with the, with Sherryl's office.

Mr. Cooper - We wouldn't want to step on Mr ...

(Tape inaudible; people talking at once).

Mr. Cooper - Yeah.

Mr. Belden - Yeah.

Mr. Cooper - But that works for everybody, doesn't it?

Mr. Moffitt - Yeah.

Mr. Cooper - Considering the frequency of our meetings, it's not too taxing, so. Alright, we'll, we'll continue with that, Mr. Belden. If you'll notify the powers that be. Any, any letters that came in? I see you got communications here.

Mr. Belden - No, these are just, this is the application for, for the church. No, the only I guess other mention should be, there's a possibility we may having another Zoning Board next month. One of the things brought before you may be a, a unique matter. I don't know if any of you are familiar with Section 280-a of the New York State Town Law.

Mr. Cooper - Oh, I know that.

Mr. Belden - Okay. You might. There's some folks down on Browns Court with a landlocked parcel, would like to sell it, but the Town Law says that you cannot obtain a building permit without, without having road frontage. So they are going through this process with the Town Board to establish an open development area and we, it will, it will require Planning Board recommendations and also an area variance, an area variance for not meeting with the Town's Highway standards. So we'll have more information if they, they...

Mrs. Corlew - If they come in.

Mr. Belden - If they decide to go forward with it. They, they got a resolution from the Town Board back in April to refer it to the Planning Board and so on, but they never, they never, they never…

Mrs. Corlew - Submitted.

Mr. Belden - ...gave us an area variance or any supporting documentation. So...

Mrs. Corlew - So it's on hold.

Mr. Belden - It'll be different.

Mr. Cooper - I think we had an issue like that years and years ago up at Forest Lake. The, it was not a town road.

Mr. Belden - Oh, Lily Pond Road or something?

Mr. Cooper - No, it goes around Forest Lake to access some properties, and every time somebody wanted to subdivide back there, this came up. Now you all know how to determine acreage from square footage. You got something out of the meeting tonight.

Mr. Moffitt - I was going to say, I learned something.

Mr. Cooper - Alright. Okay, anything else?

Mrs. Corlew - Nope.

Mr. Cooper - Alright, motion to adjourn.

Mr. Morey - Second.

Motion by James Cooper, seconded by Mark Morey and carried to adjourn Zoning Board meeting of May 8, 2014 at 7:26 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Patti Corlew Recording Secretary

Zb05082014

RESOLUTION #2014-1

Motion by: James Cooper Second by: Mark Morey

RESOLVED, to deem application ZBA #2014-1 by the Warrensburg Free Methodist Church, tax map #210.20-5-57, located at 258 River Street, for an area variance, as a Type II listed action under the State Environmental Quality Review Act.

DULY ADOPTED ON THIS 8TH DAY OF MAY, 2014 BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE:

Ayes: Donne Lynn Winslow, Alan Hall, James Cooper, Mark Morey,

Harold Moffitt Nays: None

RESOLUTION #2014-2

Motion by: James Cooper Second by: Donne Winslow

RESOLVED, to approve application ZBA #2014-1 by the Warrensburg Free Methodist Church, tax map #210.20-5-57, located at 258 River Street, for an area variance to allow conveyance of property to 250 River Street, making the lot width of this lot less then the required 125 feet.

DULY ADOPTED ON THIS 8TH DAY OF MAY, 2014 BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE:

Ayes: Donne Lynn Winslow, Alan Hall, James Cooper, Mark Morey,

Harold Moffitt Nays: None

RESOLUTION #2014-3

Motion by: Donne Winslow Seconded by: James Cooper

RESOLVED, to appoint Mark Morey as Vice Chairperson for the Warrensburg Zoning Board of Appeals for the year 2014.

DULY ADOPTED ON THIS 8TH DAY OF MAY, 2014 BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE:

Ayes: Donne Lynn Winslow, Alan Hall, James Cooper, Harold Moffitt

Nays: None

Abstention: Mark Morey

RESOLUTION #2014-4

Motion by: Donne Winslow Seconded by: Mark Morey

RESOLVED, to appoint Harold Moffitt as Secretary for the Warrensburg Zoning Board of Appeals for the year 2014.

DULY ADOPTED ON THIS 8TH DAY OF MAY, 2014 BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE:

Ayes: Donne Lynn Winslow, Alan Hall, James Cooper

Nays: None

Abstention: Harold Moffitt